

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ANGEL HERNANDEZ

PLAINTIFF,

V.

THE OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER
OF BASEBALL AND MAJOR LEAGUE
BASEBALL, BLUE INC.,

DEFENDANTS.

CASE NO: 18-CV-09035-JPO

NOTICE OF FILING

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiff Angel Hernandez hereby files the Table of Contents and Table of Authorities that accompany his Motion for Partial Summary Judgment (Dkt. 138 & 139).

Dated: April 25, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

MURPHY LANDEN JONES PLLC

By: Kevin L. Murphy
Kevin L. Murphy (*pro hac vice*)
J. Jeffrey Landen (*pro hac vice*)
Nicholas R. Gregg (*pro hac vice*)
2400 Chamber Center Drive, Suite 200
Fort Mitchell, KY 41017
Tel: 859-360-1123
KMurphy@MLJfirm.com
JLanden@MLJfirm.com
NGregg@MLJfirm.com

&

LEWIS DIBIASI ZAITA & HIGGINS
Nicholas J. Zaita
420 Lexington Avenue, Suite 300
New York, NY 10107
Tel: (212) 772-0943
nzaita@ldzhlaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Angel Hernandez

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 25, 2020, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to: Neil H. Abramson, Esq., Adam M. Lupion, Esq., Rachel S. Phillion, Esq., and Rachel S. Fischer, Esq., PROSKAUER ROSE LLP, Eleven Times Square, New York, New York 10036-8299.

Respectfully Submitted,

MURPHY LANDEN JONES PLLC

By: Kevin L. Murphy
Kevin L. Murphy (*pro hac vice*)
2400 Chamber Center Drive, Suite 200
Fort Mitchell, KY 41017
Tel: 859-360-1123
Attorney for Plaintiff Angel Hernandez

Table of Contents

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
II.	FACTS.....	1
A.	<i>MLB has known about its umpire diversity problem since at least 2013.....</i>	1
B.	<i>The Crew Chief Position and World Series Assignments.....</i>	4
i.	The Crew Chief Position.....	4
a.	<i>Factors for crew chief promotion decisions.....</i>	4
b.	<i>Crew chief promotion process.....</i>	5
c.	<i>MLB’s Diversity Policy and its impact (or lack thereof) on MLB’s crew chief promotion decisions.....</i>	5
ii.	World Series Assignments.....	6
C.	MLB’s Umpire Evaluation.....	7
D.	Plaintiff’s Qualifications.....	7
i.	2006-2009 Seasons.....	7
ii.	2011-2016 Seasons.....	8
iii.	Plaintiff’s interim crew chief experience.....	9
E.	<i>Additional Examples of MLB’s Disparate Treatment of Plaintiff.....</i>	10
i.	The Cleveland Game.....	10
ii.	MLB’s emphasis on the “perception” of Plaintiff.....	11
F.	MLB’s Promotion of White Umpires to Crew Chief.....	12
i.	Promotions for the 2017 Season.....	12
ii.	Promotions for the 2014 Season.....	16
iii.	Promotions for the 2013 Season.....	17
iv.	Other minority umpires passed over for the crew chief position.....	17
G.	<i>MLB’s World Series Selections.....</i>	19
II	ARGUMENT.....	21
A.	<i>Disparate Treatment.....</i>	21
B.	<i>Disparate Impact.....</i>	23

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

<i>Gordon v. City of New York</i> , No. 14-Civ.-6115-JPO-JCF, 2016 WL 4618969 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 2, 2016).....	23
<i>Gordon v. City of New York</i> , No. 14-CV-6115 (JPO), 2018 WL 4681615 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 28, 2018).....	22
<i>Graham v. Long Island R.R.</i> , 230 F.3d 34 (2d Cir. 2000)	22
<i>Int'l Bhd. of Teamsters v. United States</i> , 431 U.S. 324 (1977)	25
<i>Kirkland v. Cablevision Sys.</i> , 760 F.3d 223 (2d Cir. 2014).....	21
<i>Martin v. Coinmach Corp.</i> , No. 15-cv-8137 (AJN) (SN), 2016 WL 6996182 (S.D.N.Y. Nov. 29, 2016).....	23
<i>Robinson v. Metro-North Commuter R.R.</i> , 267 F.3d 147 (2d Cir. 2011)).	23
<i>Sandler v. Montefiore Health Sys., Inc.</i> , No. 16-CV-2258 (JPO), 2018 WL 4636835 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 27, 2018).....	21
<i>Terry v. Ashcroft</i> , 336 F.3d 128, 138 (2d Cir. 2003)	21
<i>Texas Dep't of Cmty. Affairs v. Burdine</i> , 450 U.S. 248 (1981).	21
<i>United States v. City of New York</i> , 713 F. Supp. 2d 300 (S.D.N.Y. 2010).....	25
<i>Victory v. Hewlett-Packard Co.</i> , 34 F. Supp. 2d 809 (E.D.N.Y. 1999).....	25
<i>Watson v. Fort Worth Bank</i> , 487 U.S. 977 (1988)	24
<i>Wright v. Stern</i> , 450 F. Supp. 2d 335 (S.D.N.Y. 2006)	23